

# *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: mechanisms and interactions between drug resistance mutations with fitness costs and the drug resistance phenotypes

R. Olamilekan Adesola, E. Ayomide Adebowale

Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, Nigeria

## ABSTRACT:

— Multidrug-resistant and extensively drug-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* are no news and have contributed to the continued scourge of tuberculosis today. Acquisition of drug resistance by *M. tuberculosis* occurs due to mutations in genes, overexpression of some genes, and changes in the expression of specific genes. Thus, the development of resistance to first and second-line drugs. A fitness cost is also paid by drug-resistant *M. tuberculosis*. This is due to their weakened virulence, transmission, and reduced growth rate under normal growth conditions. Some studies show that “Persisters” or “Phenotypic drug-tolerant” populations occur in recovered patients. This results in a relapse of treated patients in immunosuppressive conditions. Findings suggest that drug-tolerant persister populations exist following antibiotic treatment, even if they are temporarily undetected by conventional microbiologic approaches. Drug resistance is a global issue that poses a danger to effective *M. tuberculosis* control. Even though drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis* is linked to changes in various genes, many resistant strains lack these common mutations. This review aims at delivering a comprehensive overview to global health authorities and prospective readers worldwide, thus improving the knowledge of the molecular basis of drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis*.

— **Keywords:** Drug resistance, Mutation, Tuberculosis, Genes, Fitness Cost.

## INTRODUCTION

Multiple-drug therapy, while helpful, does not guarantee the absence of drug-resistant infections. As a result, we cannot be sure that multidrug therapy will not lead to drug-resistant tubercle bacilli<sup>1</sup>.

According to the World Health Organization's (WHO) 2014 global tuberculosis report<sup>2</sup>, there had been approximately 9.0 million new tuberculosis (TB) patients and 1.5 million deaths in 2013. In addition, 3.5% of newly diagnosed and 20.5% of previously treated

patients had multidrug-resistant TB (MDR-TB, defined as bacillary resistance to at least rifampicin [RMP] and Isoniazid [INH]) in 2013. Eastern Europe and Central Asia had the highest prevalence of MDR-TB, with rates exceeding 20% and 50%, respectively. Furthermore, by the end of 2012, the WHO had received reports of at least one case of extensively drug-resistant tuberculosis (XDR-TB, defined as MDR-TB with additional resistance to fluoroquinolone(s) [FQs] and one or more of three second-line injectable drugs [SLIDs], namely capreomycin [CPM], kanamycin [KM], and amikacin



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/)

[AMK]). XDR-TB was found in about 9% of MDR-TB patients. As a result, the global drug-resistant tuberculosis (DR-TB) epidemic continues to be a serious concern, which is exacerbated by co-infection with the human immunodeficiency virus (HIV)<sup>3</sup>.

In *M. tuberculosis*, two forms of antibiotic resistance are known: genetic and phenotypic resistance. Mutations in chromosomal genes cause drug resistance in growing bacteria. In contrast, phenotypic resistance or drug tolerance is caused by epigenetic alterations in gene expression and protein modification in non-growing persister bacteria. The two types of resistance have generated a slew of issues in effective TB control, with genetic resistance, as seen in MDR-/XDR-TB, wreaking havoc worldwide. In contrast, phenotypic drug resistance, or tolerance as seen in persisters, necessitates prolonged treatment and increases the risk of post-treatment relapse<sup>4,5</sup>. *In vivo*, the situation appears to be more complicated, with the two types of resistance overlapping and interconverting. Prior stress or sub-inhibitory drug concentrations can induce efflux pump expression, resulting in phenotypic resistance and possibly facilitating the development of more stable genetic drug resistance<sup>6</sup>.

In contrast, genetic drug resistance in growing organisms can develop the persistence of phenotypic resistance. Understanding the biology of mycobacterial persisters and creating anti-tuberculosis medications that target them is becoming increasingly popular amongst researchers. The selection of genetic mutations predominantly develops drug-resistant strains of *M. tuberculosis*. This is almost entirely artificial, resulting from poor physician prescribing or patient compliance. However, recent evidence suggests that pharmacokinetic-pharmacodynamics situations involving the stimulation of the mycobacterial drug efflux pump may aid the establishment of genetic alterations in *M. tuberculosis*<sup>7</sup>. The development of drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis* due to mutations in drug resistance genes may cost the organism's fitness and virulence. Recent comprehensive analyses<sup>8,9</sup> have suggested a link between *M. tuberculosis* primary resistance and HIV co-infection, implying that transmitted DR-TB poses a severe barrier to managing this patient population. In addition, recent investigations<sup>11</sup> from China have found that a considerable number of MDR- and XDR-TB cases are due to active transmission of (mostly) the Beijing genotype ("W-Beijing")<sup>10</sup>, and the same genotype is found in Europe and Africa<sup>12</sup>. This is a concerning development that necessitates additional research to understand how such virulent DRTB strains evolve and adapt in the host and the need for more effective transmission control methods.

Antibiotic resistance is typically linked to fitness losses, such as those caused by high energy consumption by resistance machinery or the onerous expression of resistance proteins<sup>13-17</sup>. These findings show that a bacterial population should be biased away from drug resistance without antibiotic pressure<sup>18-20</sup>. Compensatory mutations and precise regulation of costly protein production lower the effective cost in practice, substantially eliminating fitness disparities. For example,

tetracycline-resistant bacteria that produce the expensive TetA efflux pump are likely to be outcompeted by susceptible strains in an antibiotic-free environment<sup>21</sup>. However, experiments have shown that the fitness cost of tetracycline resistance without antibiotic pressure is minimal<sup>19,22</sup>. This review aims at clarifying the mechanisms and interactions between drug resistance mutations with fitness costs and the drug resistance phenotypes of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*.

## GENES INVOLVED IN DRUG RESISTANCE, MECHANISMS, INTERACTIONS, MUTATIONS AND DRUG RESISTANCE ACQUISITION

A good number of genes naturally found in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* contribute to its well-renowned drug resistance with the occurrence of multidrug-resistant (MDR) and extensively drug-resistant (XDR) strains. *M. tuberculosis*, like every other bacterium, possesses intrinsic mechanisms of drug resistance, including a thicker and more hydrophobic cell wall due to the presence of a variety of lipids, which include mycolic acids to prevent drug penetration. It also possesses various enzymes that hydrolyze various drugs, such as  $\beta$ -lactamases, which break down  $\beta$ -lactam antibiotics, and enzymatic drug target modification and drug efflux from the cytoplasm<sup>23</sup>.

The genes of interest in mycobacterial drug resistance are numerous, and this work is focused on those relevant to resistance to first and second-line anti-tubercular drugs.

### KatG

The *katG* gene is a 2223bp long gene with locus MG995340, which encodes the protein Catalase-Peroxidase in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. It is a bi-functional enzyme oxidizing numerous electron sources, including NADP (H), with catalase and broad-spectrum peroxidase activity<sup>25</sup>. It protects *M. tuberculosis* from damaging reactive oxygen species (ROS), such as hydrogen peroxide and organic peroxides, by dismutation and helps it surviving in host macrophages by preventing phagocyte oxidative burst<sup>26,27</sup>.

The enzyme Catalase-Peroxidase has a function in acquiring drug resistance by *M. tuberculosis*, that is, its broad-spectrum catalase and peroxidase activity that leads to the oxidation of numerous electron sources, including NADP(H). Consequently, this leads to activating one of the essential first-line anti-tubercular drugs, i.e., Isoniazid, administered as a pro-drug. In its pro-drug form, INH penetrates the bacterial cell to the cytoplasm, where it is activated. Therefore, the enzyme encoded by *katG* mediates the susceptibility of *M. tuberculosis* to Isoniazid<sup>28</sup>. This phenomenon is of particular interest as it has been shown that in *Escherichia coli*, with a similar Catalase-Peroxidase enzyme called hydroperoxidase 1, the activity of this enzyme does not induce isoniazid susceptibility<sup>28</sup>.

It has been noticed in most isoniazid-resistant strains of *M. tuberculosis* that resistance is linked to either simple base pair alterations that result in missense mutations or minor deletions in the *katG* gene<sup>29-32</sup>. Many isoniazid-resistant clinical isolates have mutations in *katG*, which cause catalase/peroxidase activity to be abolished or decreased, resulting in a lack of Isoniazid activation or a lower affinity for Isoniazid. Other Isoniazid resistance pathways include *katG* gene deletion and *katG* expression down-regulation caused by mutations in the *furA-katG* intergenic region<sup>33-35</sup>. The most critical mutation in the *katG* gene that contributes to isoniazid resistance results in a single change of the primary protein structure, with the replacement of the amino acid serine with threonine at position 315; thus, the generation of Isoniazid-NAD adducts is reduced by a factor of 20, and affinity for Isoniazid is greatly diminished<sup>35,36</sup>.

### InhA

The *inhA* gene is an 828bp DNA long gene with locus MG995265, which encodes the protein, Enoyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] reductase [NADH] in *M. tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. Functionally, the type II fatty acid synthase (FAS-II) system enzyme enoyl-ACP reductase is involved in the production of mycolic acids, which are a key component of mycobacterial cell walls<sup>37</sup>. It catalyzes the NADH-dependent reduction of the double bond of 2-Trans-enoyl-[acyl-carrier protein], which is a significant step in the FAS-II pathway's fatty acid elongation<sup>38</sup>. Phosphorylation on Thr-266 lowers *InhA* activity (5-fold reduction) and presumably negatively controls mycolic acid production and bacterial growth<sup>39,40</sup>.

*InhA*, much like *katG*, mediates resistance to Isoniazid and ethionamide (ETH), a second-line anti-tubercular drug<sup>41</sup>. The enzyme encoded by *inhA*, Enoyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] reductase, is NADH-dependent. Its function of interest in mediating drug resistance is the part it plays in mycolic acid synthesis as part of the bacterial FAS-II system. Isoniazid, in its active form, forms a covalent compound with Enoyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] reductase and *kasA*, a beta-ketoacyl carrier protein synthetase, which prevents mycolic acid synthesis and kills the cell. Isoniazid's action against *InhA* is mediated via covalent attachment of the drug's activated form to NAD's nicotinamide ring and binding of the INH-NAD adduct to *inhA*'s active site<sup>42,43</sup>. Ethionamide, a drug similar in structure to Isoniazid, also inhibits mycolic acid synthesis in *M. tuberculosis*<sup>44</sup>.

It has been observed<sup>45</sup> that the overexpression of *inhA* confers isoniazid and ethionamide resistance to *M. tuberculosis*, and there is a good amount of cross-resistance between both drugs. Many clinical isolates resistant to Isoniazid and ethionamide have mutations in the *inhA* gene. The single substitution of alanine for serine 94 confers resistance to Isoniazid and ethionamide; this drug resistance appears to be directly related to a disruption in the hydrogen-bonding network that reduces the binding of NADH and the INH-NAD adduct<sup>43,46</sup>.

### AhpC

The *ahpC* gene is a 255bp DNA long gene with locus MTU43812 that encodes the Alkyl hydroperoxide reductase C protein in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. Hydrogen peroxide and organic hydroperoxides are reduced to water and alcohol, respectively, by this thiol-specific peroxidase. Detoxifying peroxides aids in cell defence against oxidative stress. With *AhpD*, *DlaT*, and *Lpd*, it forms an NADH-dependent peroxidase that can degrade hydrogen and alkyl peroxides while also acting as a peroxy-nitrite reductase, shielding the bacterium against reactive nitrogen intermediates and oxidative stress caused by the host immune system<sup>47-49</sup>.

*AhpC* encodes alkyl hydroperoxide reductase C, an enzyme that serves to protect *M. tuberculosis* from oxidative stress from reactive nitrogen intermediates and hydrogen peroxides produced by the host cell, as stated earlier. No mutations in the *ahpC* have been shown to mediate resistance to Isoniazid; however, in an extensive collection of Isoniazid (INH)-resistant clinical isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, mutations in the regulatory region of the *ahpC* gene that result in overproduction of alkyl hydroperoxide reductase were found often, but not in INH-susceptible bacteria. The overexpression of *ahpC* does not appear to be harmful. However, because most of these strains were already catalase-peroxidase deficient, this is critical for INH resistance<sup>50</sup>.

### KasA

The *kasA* gene is a 1251bp DNA long gene that encodes the protein, 3-oxoacyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] synthase 1 in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. It is a part of the mycobacterial fatty acid elongation system, FAS-II, which is important in mycolic acid synthesis. It specifically catalyzes long-chain acyl-ACP substrates' elongation by adding two malonyl-ACP carbons to an acyl group acceptor<sup>51,52</sup>. It is also involved in the mycolate chain's initial elongation and the formation of monounsaturated fatty acids with an average carbon length of forty<sup>53</sup>.

*kasA*, much like *inhA*, encodes the enzyme, 3-oxoacyl-[acyl-carrier-protein] synthase 1. As stated earlier, this enzyme is also a part of the mycobacterial fatty acid elongation system, FAS-II, important in mycolic acid synthesis. The enzyme is a target of the activated form of Isoniazid, forming a part of the covalent complex along with *inhA* that inhibits mycolic acid synthesis and kills the bacteria. It is also worthy of note that *kasA* is a target for and is inhibited by the indazole JSF-3285<sup>54</sup>; unlike *inhA*, where its overexpression plays a significant part in drug resistance<sup>45</sup>, *kasA* has undergone several mutations that contribute to drug resistance. The mutations include a change of Aspartate to Asparagine at position 66, Glycine to Serine at position 269, Glycine to Serine at position 312, and Phenylalanine to Leucine at position 413, with all four mutations contributing to increased resistance to Isoniazid<sup>53</sup>.

## RpoB

The *rpoB* gene is a 1577bp DNA long gene with locus MG995115 that encodes the protein, DNA-directed RNA polymerase subunit beta in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. It is a DNA-dependent RNA polymerase that uses the four ribonucleoside triphosphates as substrates to catalyze the transcription of DNA into RNA<sup>55</sup>.

The gene *rpoB* encodes the protein DNA-directed RNA polymerase subunit beta, and this is the target of the first-line drug Rifampin, which is bacteriocidal for *M. tuberculosis*. Rifampin binds to the beta-subunit of RNA polymerase to inhibit its activity<sup>56</sup>.

Point mutations in the *rpoB* gene sequence lead to changes in the protein sequence of the polymerase that prevent rifampin binding and mediate resistance. The amino acid changes include a change of glutamate to arginine in position 138, isoleucine to alanine in position 147, lysine to alanine in position 148, and finally serine to alanine in position 149, with these mutations contributing to increasing resistance to Rifampin<sup>57,58</sup>.

## RRS

The RRS gene, also known as the 16S rRNA gene, is a 1550bp DNA long gene that encodes the ribosome's small subunit ribosomal RNA molecules, which are responsible for the critical step of turning genetic material into functional cell components *via* mRNA to protein translation in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>59</sup>.

The 16S-rRNA subunit encoded by the RRS gene targets the first-line drugs (Streptomycin), and second-line injectable drugs (Kanamycin, Capreomycin, and Amikacin). Mutations in this gene have been shown to confer resistance to the above-listed medicines, and these mutations include: Alanine-Glycine substitution at position 1408, Threonine-Alanine at 1406, Cysteine-Threonine at 1409, and Glycine-Threonine at 1491<sup>60,61</sup>.

## RsmG/GidB

The *rsmG/gidB* gene is a 568bp DNA long gene with locus MK783876 that encodes the Ribosomal protein RNA small subunit methyltransferase G in *M. tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv). It functions to methylate the N7 position of guanine in position 518 of 16S rRNA precisely<sup>24</sup>.

GidB is one of the most conserved genes in all bacterial species, being highly conserved in both gram-positive and gram-negative species. Mutations in this gene have been shown to cause a low level of resistance to Streptomycin in *M. tuberculosis* and possibly in all other bacteria<sup>61</sup>. The mutation responsible for this resistance is a deletion of alanine at position 488<sup>61</sup>.

## EmbB

The *embB* gene is an 860bp DNA long gene with locus MK526900 that encodes the protein arabinosyl-transferase

in *M. tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. Arabinosyl-transferase is a polymerization enzyme that converts arabinose to arabinan in arabinogalactan, an essential component of the mycobacterial cell wall of *M. tuberculosis*<sup>62</sup>.

The arabinosyl-transferase encoded by the gene *embB* is the target for the first-line anti-tubercular drug, Ethambutol, whose mechanism of action involves inhibiting the enzyme's activity and thus preventing bacterial cell wall formation. Two main methods acquire resistance to Ethambutol. Firstly, there are many mutations in *embB* that confer ethambutol resistance, which include: Serine-Alanine at position 297, Methionine- Isoleucine/Leucine/Valine at position 306, Aspartate-Glycine/Tyrosine at position 328, Phenylalanine-Valine at position 330, Tyrosine-Histidine at position 336, Glycine-Alanine/Cysteine/Aspartate at position 406, Glutamine - Lysine/Arginine at position 497, Glycine-Aspartate at position 745, Aspartate-Alanine at position 959, Methionine-Arginine at position 1000, Aspartate-Asparagine at position 1024<sup>63,64</sup>. Secondly, overexpression of *embB* also results in resistance to Ethambutol<sup>65</sup>.

## GyrA and GyrB

These two genes, 2517bp and 2028bp DNA long genes, respectively with loci MG995190 and MG995415 respectively, encode the two portions of the DNA gyrase subunits A and B in *M. tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. DNA gyrase A type II topoisomerase supercoils closed circular double-stranded (ds) DNA in an ATP-dependent way to keep chromosomes un-wound while relaxing supercoiled dsDNA in the absence of ATP<sup>66,67</sup>. Interconversion of other topological isomers of dsDNA rings, such as catenanes, is also catalyzed by this enzyme<sup>68</sup>. It is also worthy of note that, in comparison to *E. coli*, *M. tuberculosis*' gyrase shows a stronger decatenation than supercoiling activity; since *M. tuberculosis* only possesses one type II topoisomerase, its gyrase must also perform the decatenation function of topoisomerase IV<sup>66,69</sup>.

These genes encode the two A and B subunits of the protein DNA gyrase, which targets the essential second-line anti-tubercular drug group, the fluoroquinolones. These drugs block mycobacterial DNA synthesis by inhibiting the activity of DNA gyrase (topoisomerase II) and topoisomerase IV. DNA gyrase inhibition prevents the relaxation of the positively supercoiled DNA, an essential step in bacterial transcription and, thus, replication<sup>70</sup>. One or more point mutations mediate a high level of resistance to fluoroquinolones in the *gyrA* and *gyrB* genes. The number of mutations elucidated in both genes is tremendous and cannot be discussed here, and more information can be found in cited literature<sup>70-75</sup>.

## TlyA

The *tlyA* gene is a 696bp DNA long gene with locus MK783785 that encodes the protein 16S/23S rRNA (cytidine-2'-O)-methyltransferase TlyA in *M. tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. It acts as a host evasion

factor that plays a crucial role in *M. tuberculosis* pathogenesis by modifying adaptive immune responses and suppressing host protective Th1 and Th17 cytokine responses and autophagy<sup>76</sup>. Also, 2'-O-methylation at nucleotides C1409 in 16S rRNA and C1920 in 23S rRNA is catalyzed by this enzyme, with the enzyme also exhibiting *in vitro* hemolytic activities<sup>77,78</sup>.

The protein 16S/23S rRNA (cytidine-2'-O)-methyltransferase is the target for the second-line anti-tubercular drug capreomycin, an aminoglycoside. Capreomycin is an irreversible inhibitor of protein synthesis by binding to and preventing the activity of the above-stated protein<sup>77</sup>. In addition, TlyA appears to influence the ribosome, and capreomycin resistance is conferred by tlyA mutation<sup>79,80</sup>.

### PncA

The pncA gene is a 561bp DNA long gene with locus KY659393 that encodes the protein nicotinamidase/pyrazinamidase in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (strain ATCC 25618/H37Rv)<sup>24</sup>. Deamidation of nicotinamide (NAM) to nicotinate is catalyzed by this enzyme<sup>81</sup>.

The enzyme encoded by the pncA gene, nicotinamidase/pyrazinamidase, converts the pro-drug pyrazinamide to its active form, pyrazinoic acid. Mutations have been detected in the pncA gene of pyrazinamide-resistant *M. tuberculosis*, most of which vary from a total loss of enzymatic activity to a decrease in enzymatic activity on pyrazinamide. However, the fold of decline differs for each mutation. These mutations include Aspartate-Alanine at position 8 (total loss of enzymatic activity), Aspartate-Alanine at position 49 (410-fold decrease in enzymatic activity), Histidine-Alanine at position 51 (21-fold reduction in enzymatic activity), Histidine-Alanine at position 57 (164 fold decrease in enzymatic activity), Serine-Alanine at position 59 (2.4 fold decrease in enzymatic activity), Histidine-Alanine at position 71 (100 fold decrease in enzymatic activity), Lysine-Alanine at position 96 (total loss of enzymatic activity), Serine-Alanine at position 104 (3 fold decrease in enzymatic activity), and Cysteine-Alanine at position 138 (total loss of enzymatic activity)<sup>81</sup>.

### FITNESS COSTS ASSOCIATED WITH DRUG RESISTANCE

*Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains that are highly drug-resistant are a severe impediment to stopping the spread of tuberculosis in many contexts. According to recent World Health Organization estimates, approximately 450,000 (possible range, 300,000-600,000) incident cases of multidrug-resistant (MDR), *M. tuberculosis* (defined as a strain resistant to at least Isoniazid and rifampicin)<sup>82</sup> is already a well-known issue in areas where drug-resistant tuberculosis accounts for a significant proportion of tuberculosis cases or where the total burden of MDR tuberculosis is high, the threat that these highly resistant strains of *M. tuberculosis* pose to global containment is highly dependent on their evolutionary fitness<sup>83,84</sup>.

Antibiotic resistance-causing mutations are frequently associated with fitness costs<sup>85-91</sup>. While early studies<sup>85,90,92,93</sup> of *in vitro*-generated resistance suggested that mutations associated with *M. tuberculosis* resistance impaired bacterial growth rates or virulence, recent evidence<sup>94</sup> shows that mutations observed among clinical drug-resistant *M. tuberculosis* strains differ from those observed among these laboratory-derived resistant mutants. These mutations are frequently not associated with a reduction in growth rate<sup>88,95</sup> and are often equally transmissible as their laboratory-derived resistant mutants. These drug-resistant mutants' lack of significant deficiencies could be due to low-cost resistance-conferring mutations or higher-cost resistance-conferring mutations that originated in so-called pre-adapted genetic backgrounds and were later compensated by additional mutations<sup>88,96-101</sup>.

Evolutionary fitness, on the other hand, is a complicated feature that requires MDR *M. tuberculosis* to successfully infect, multiply, and transfer to a secondary host<sup>102,103</sup>, while laboratory assays designed to evaluate fitness give valuable controlled and repeatable data, findings from *in vitro* techniques may not always correlate with evolutionary or epidemiological fitness<sup>104,105</sup> (i.e., transmissibility). On the other hand, epidemiological fitness is usually explored using cluster-based analysis, in which researchers compare the genetic similarities of sample isolates to discover possible transmission clusters.

Mutations have long conferred aminoglycoside resistance in the rpsL gene, which codes for the ribosomal protein S12 in *Escherichia coli* and *Salmonella species*. It has recently been linked<sup>106,107</sup> to the exact mechanism of *M. tuberculosis*. Lys43Arg is the only known rpsL mutation that allows non-restrictive ribosomal elongation and growth rates equivalent to wild-type *M. tuberculosis*<sup>108</sup>. Almost all experimental studies<sup>104,109-112</sup> The Lys43Arg substitution in *M. tuberculosis* and other organisms has been shown to be a low-cost resistance mutation that may remunerate in cis for higher-cost rpsL mutations and is potentially more virulent in vivo than other aminoglycoside resistance mutations.

### PHENOTYPIC DRUG TOLERANCE

Bigger<sup>113</sup> coined the word "persisters" in 1944 to describe bacteria that resisted drugs without developing heritable resistance. Persistence was eventually dubbed "phenotypic drug resistance" or "phenotypic tolerance" after the quality that allowed persisters to live. These early experiments<sup>112,113</sup> significantly impact today's anti-infective finding approaches.

Hobby and Lenert<sup>114</sup> expanded the study of phenotypic tolerance to include a different pathogen, *M. tuberculosis*, and two additional medications, Isoniazid, and para-aminosalicylate, two decades later. Isoniazid inhibits mycolic acid production, para-aminosalicylate inhibits folate synthesis, and penicillin inhibits peptidoglycan synthesis. As a result, phenotypic tolerance was unaffected by the antibiotic's chemical class or inhibited mechanisms.

The issue of persisters is crucial to tuberculosis treatment. It is thought to be one of the reasons why, in formal studies, the current WHO-approved treatment regimen for drug-sensitive tuberculosis takes six months to cure 95% of participants; in standard practice, the cure rate is around 86%. Drug-resistant tuberculosis usually requires more than two years of treatment, and a cure is rarely attained<sup>115</sup>. In the Cornell model<sup>116-118</sup>, mice with drug-sensitive tuberculosis treated with Isoniazid and pyrazinamide for two months harbour no detectable colony-forming units of *M. tuberculosis* when their organ homogenates are distributed on bacteriologic agar. However, one-third of the remaining mice in the same cohort relapse spontaneously after a few months, and virtually all relapse if immunosuppressed with corticosteroids, anti-IFN, anti-TNF, or inhibitors of inducible nitric oxide synthase. The *M. tuberculosis* recovered during relapse is just as susceptible to Isoniazid and pyrazinamide as the inoculated population. These findings suggest that drug-tolerant persister populations exist following antibiotic treatment, even if they are temporarily undetected by conventional microbiologic approaches. Similarly, *M. tuberculosis* was found<sup>119,120</sup> in sputa from roughly 80% of treatment-naïve tuberculosis patients, although it was not measurable by CFU analysis.

The difficulty of turning the previous knowledge into a faster and more efficient tuberculosis treatment is illustrated by the experience with metronidazole. In several animal models, *M. tuberculosis* experiences hypoxia in necrotic granulomas. Hypoxia causes mycobacteria to stop reproducing *in vitro* and develop phenotypic tolerance to most treatments. On the other hand, metronidazole is an antibacterial and anti-parasitic medication that kills hypoxic mycobacteria *in vitro*. As a result, metronidazole appeared to be a good choice for killing non-replicating *M. tuberculosis*. However, metronidazole action in tuberculosis animal models did not always correspond with hypoxia in granulomas<sup>121-128</sup>. Other than contributing to peripheral neuropathy, metronidazole improved the proportion of patients whose sputum became smear- or culture-negative after one month of treatment but had no effect on treatment outcome at six months<sup>129</sup>. In retrospect, metronidazole's capacity to kill hypoxic *M. tuberculosis in vitro* was investigated without an alternate electron acceptor, putting the organism at a more significant disadvantage than it would experience *in vivo*. *M. tuberculosis* can receive electrons from various sources, including nitrate and fumarate<sup>130-132</sup>. Nitrate is a naturally occurring component of human bodily fluid. The *in vitro* efficacy of pyrazinamide was significantly reduced when nitrate was added<sup>128</sup>.

The experience with metronidazole implies that finding medicines with the exceptional quality of killing bacteria that are phenotypically tolerant to most other antibiotics may not be enough. It is also essential to understand how bacteria become phenotypically tolerant. It concerns how the bacteria are prevented from replicating if phenotypic tolerance is created by using settings that prevent them from reproducing. The more closely the conditions match those in the host, the more probable medications that operate under those settings will also work in the host.

The above statements constitute a hypothesis that is currently being tested. It took another 40 years after Bigger's publication<sup>113</sup> for Coates to propose large-scale screening to target non-replicating *M. tuberculosis*. His idea seemed timely when many pharmaceutical companies cut back or abandoned anti-infective research. Other companies followed the industry's traditional practice of looking for broad-spectrum drugs that could heal widespread infections in economically prosperous areas. Only after 1999 a new financing landscape<sup>133</sup> emerged, favouring academic-collaborations for drug discovery for infectious diseases that primarily affected financially disadvantaged regions. Pharmaceutical corporations and their academic partners only started large-scale screenings for medications targeting phenotypically tolerant mycobacteria approximately ten years ago<sup>134</sup>.

## CONCLUSIONS

Drug resistance is a global issue that poses a danger to effective *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* control. Even though drug resistance in *M. tuberculosis* is linked to changes in various genes, many resistant strains lack these common mutations. Therefore, from a clinical standpoint, having diagnostic techniques that are simple to use, affordable, and deliver quick results on a strain's medication sensitivity or resistance is probably more crucial. However, given the dynamics of tuberculosis transmission and the need to create new anti-TB medications, it is critical to expand our understanding of drug resistance's molecular basis in all its complexities. It is essential to understand the link between specific mutations and the development of MDR-TB, as well as the link between drug resistance and fitness costs. This would allow for a more accurate forecast of future illness scenarios and a better evaluation of the transmission dynamics of resistant strains. Furthermore, understanding the molecular basis of drug resistance would aid in the more rational development of new medications, which is now critical, given the rising prevalence of MDR- and XDR-TB around the world.

### FUNDING:

None.

### CONFLICT OF INTEREST:

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

### ORCID ID:

Adebowale Ezekiel Ayomide: 0000-0001-9988-6339

Ridwan Olamilekan Adesola: 0000-0001-7810-526

## REFERENCES

1. McDermott W. Antimicrobial therapy of pulmonary tuberculosis. *Bull World Health Organ* 1960; 23: 427-461.
2. World Health Organization. Global tuberculosis report, 2014. WHO/HTM/TB/2014.08. Geneva, Switzerland: WHO 2014.
3. Dean AS, Zignol M, Falzon D, Getahun H, Floyd K. HIV and multidrug-resistant tuberculosis: overlapping epidemics. *Eur Respir J* 2014; 44: 251-254.

4. Zhang Y, Yew WW, Barer MR. Targeting persisters for tuberculosis control. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2012; 56: 2223-2230.
5. Zhang Y. Persisters, persistent infections and the Yin-Yang model. *Emerg Microbes Infect* 2014; 3: e3.
6. Rodrigues L, Machado D, Couto I, Amaral L, Viveiros M. Contribution of efflux activity to isoniazid resistance in the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex. *Infect Genet Evol* 2012; 12: 695-700.
7. Pasipanodya JG, Gumbo T. A new evolutionary and pharmacokinetic-pharmacodynamic scenario for rapid emergence of resistance to single and multiple anti-tuberculosis drugs. *Curr Opin Pharmacol* 2011; 11: 457-463.
8. Suchindran S, Brouwer ES, Van Rie A. Is HIV infection a risk factor for multidrug-resistant tuberculosis? A systematic review. *PLoS One* 2009; 4: e5561.
9. Mesfin YM, Hailemariam D, Biadgilign S, Kibret KT. Association between HIV/AIDS and multidrug resistance tuberculosis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *PLoS One* 2014; 9: e82235.
10. Zhao Y, Xu S, Wang L, Chin DP, Wang S, Jiang G, Xia H, Zhou Y, Li Q, Ou X, Pang Y, Song Y, Zhao B, Zhang H, He G, Guo J, Wang Y. National survey of drug-resistant tuberculosis in China. *N Engl J Med* 2012; 366: 2161-2170.
11. Larissa O, Fiorella K, Cristina T, Carlos Z, Francine M, Eduardo G, Patrick VS, Carlos S. High prevalence of primary multidrug-resistant tuberculosis in persons with no known risk factors. *PLoS One* 2011; 6: e26276.
12. Nonkqubela B, Gaetan K, Catherine C, Roxana R, Tarylee R, Ted C, Alexander SP. High rates of potentially infectious tuberculosis and multidrug-resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB) among hospital inpatients in KwaZulu Natal, South Africa indicate risk of nosocomial transmission. *PLoS One* 2014; 9: e90868.
13. Wood KB, Cluzel P. Trade-offs between drug toxicity and benefit in the multi-antibiotic resistance system underlie optimal growth of *E. coli*. *BMC Syst Biol* 2012; 6: 48.
14. Marcusson LL, Frimodt-Møller N, Hughes D. Interplay in the selection of fluoroquinolone resistance and bacterial fitness. *PLoS Pathog* 2009; 5: e1000541.
15. Turner WJ, Dunlop MJ. Trade-offs in improving biofuel tolerance using combinations of efflux pumps. *ACS Synth Biol* 2015; 4: 1056-1063.
16. Andersson DI, Hughes D. Antibiotic resistance and its cost: is it possible to reverse resistance? *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2010; 8: 260-271.
17. Hernando-Amado S, Sanz-García F, Blanco P, Martínez JL. Fitness costs associated with the acquisition of antibiotic resistance. *Essay in Biochem* 2017; 61: 37-48.
18. Levin BR. Models for the spread of resistant pathogens. *Neth J Med* 2002; 60: 58-64.
19. De Gelder L, Ponciano JM, Top EM. Combining mathematical models and statistical methods to understand and predict the dynamics of antibiotic-sensitive mutants in a population of resistant bacteria during experimental evolution. *Genetics* 2004; 168: 1131-1144.
20. Levin BR, Lipsitch M, Stewart FM. The population genetics of antibiotic resistance. *Clin Infect Dis* 1997; 24: 9-16.
21. Nguyen TN, Phan QG, Lenski RE. Effects of carriage and expression of the Tn10 tetracycline-resistance operon on the fitness of *Escherichia coli* K12. *Mol Biol Evol* 1989; 6: 213-225.
22. Palmer AC, Angelino E, Kishony R. Chemical decay of an antibiotic inverts selection for resistance. *Nat Chem Biol* 2010; 6: 105-107.
23. Gygli SM, Borrell S, Trauner A, Gagneux S. Antimicrobial resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Mechanistic and evolutionary perspectives. *FEMS Microbiol Rev* 2017; 41: 354-373.
24. Uniprot. Available at: <https://www.uniprot.org/>.
25. Johnsson K, Froland WA, Schultz PG. Overexpression, Purification, and Characterization of the Catalase-peroxidase KatG from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Biol Chem* 1997; 272: 2834-2840.
26. Ng VH, Cox JS, Sousa AO, MacMicking JD, McKinney JD. Role of KatG catalase-peroxidase in mycobacterial pathogenesis: Countering the phagocyte oxidative burst. *Mol Microbiol* 2004; 52: 1291-1302.
27. Sherman DR, Mdluli K, Hickey MJ, Arain TM, Morris SL, Barry CE 3rd, Stover CK. Compensatory *ahpC* gene expression in isoniazid-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Science* 1996; 272: 1641-1643.
28. Heym B, Zhang Y, Poulet S, Young D, Cole ST. Characterization of the *katG* gene encoding a catalase-peroxidase required for the isoniazid susceptibility of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Bacteriol* 1993; 175: 4255-4259.
29. Altamirano M, Marostenmaki J, Wong A, FitzGerald M, Black WA, Smith JA. Mutations in the catalase-peroxidase gene from isoniazid-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* isolates. *J Infect Dis* 1994; 169: 1162-1165.
30. Cockerill FR 3rd, Uhl JR, Temesgen Z, Zhang Y, Stockman L, Roberts GD, Williams DL, Kline BC. Rapid identification of a point mutation of the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* catalase-peroxidase (*katG*) gene associated with isoniazid resistance. *J Infect Dis* 1995; 171: 240-245.
31. Heym B, Alzari PM, Honoré N, Cole ST. Missense mutations in the catalase-peroxidase gene, *katG*, are associated with isoniazid resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Mol Microbiol* 1995; 15: 235-245.
32. Rouse DA, Li Z, Bai GH, Morris SL. Characterization of the *katG* and *inhA* genes of isoniazid-resistant clinical isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1995; 39: 2472-2477.
33. Ando H, Kitao T, Miyoshi-Akiyama T, Kato S, Mori T, Kirikae T. Downregulation of *katG* expression is associated with isoniazid resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Mol Microbiol* 2011; 79: 1615-1628.
34. Zhang Y, Heym B, Allen B, Young D, Cole S. The catalase-peroxidase gene and isoniazid resistance of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Nature* 1992; 358: 591-593.
35. Zhao X, Hersleth HP, Zhu J, Andersson KK, Magliozzo RS. Access channel residues Ser315 and Asp137 in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* catalase-peroxidase (KatG) control peroxidatic activation of the pro-drug Isoniazid. *Chem Commun (Camb)* 2013; 49: 11650-11652.
36. Zhao X, Yu H, Yu S, Wang F, Sacchettini JC, Magliozzo RS. Hydrogen peroxide-mediated isoniazid activation catalyzed by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* catalase-peroxidase (KatG) and its S315T mutant. *Biochemistry* 2006; 45: 4131-4140.
37. Duan X, Xiang X, Xie J. Crucial components of *Mycobacterium* type II fatty acid biosynthesis (Fas-II) and their inhibitors. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 2014; 360: 87-99.
38. Quémard A, Sacchettini JC, Dessen A, Vilcheze C, Bittman R, Jacobs WR Jr, Blanchard JS. Enzymatic characterization of the target for isoniazid in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Biochemistry* 1995; 34: 8235-8241.
39. Khan S, Nagarajan SN, Parikh A, Samantaray S, Singh A, Kumar D, Roy RP, Bhatt A, Nandicoori VK. Phosphorylation of Noyl-Acyl Carrier Protein Reductase *InhA* Impacts *Mycobacterial* Growth and Survival. *J Biol Chem* 2010; 285: 37860-37871.
40. Molle V, Gulten G, Vilchèze C, Veyron-Churlet R, Zanella-Cléon I, Sacchettini JC, Jacobs WR Jr, Kremer L. Phosphorylation of *InhA* inhibits mycolic acid biosynthesis and growth of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Mol Microbiol* 2010; 78: 1591-1605.
41. Banerjee A, Dubnau E, Quémard A, Balasubramanian V, Um KS, Wilson T, Collins D, de Lisle G, Jacobs WR Jr. *inhA*, a gene encoding a target for isoniazid and ethionamide in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Science* 1994; 263: 227-230.

42. Rozwarski DA, Grant GA, Barton DH, Jacobs WR Jr, Sacchettini JC. Modification of the NADH of the isoniazid target (InhA) from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Science* 1998; 279: 98-102.
43. Vilchèze C, Wang F, Arai M, Hazbón MH, Colangeli R, Kremer L, Weisbrod TR, Alland D, Sacchettini JC, Jacobs WR Jr. Transfer of a point mutation in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis inhA* resolves the target of isoniazid. *Nat Med* 2006; 12: 1027-1029.
44. Quémard A, Lanéelle G, Lacave C. Mycolic acid synthesis: A target for ethionamide in mycobacteria? *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1992; 36: 1316-1321.
45. Larsen MH, Vilchèze C, Kremer L, Besra GS, Parsons L, Salfinger M, Heifets L, Hazbón MH, Alland D, Sacchettini JC, Jacobs WR Jr. Overexpression of *inhA*, but not *kasA*, confers resistance to isoniazid and ethionamide in *Mycobacterium smegmatis*, *M. bovis* BCG and *M. tuberculosis*. *Mol Microbiol* 2002; 46: 453-466.
46. Dessen A, Quémard A, Blanchard JS, Jacobs WR Jr, Sacchettini JC. Crystal structure and function of the isoniazid target of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Science* 1995; 267: 1638-1641.
47. Bryk R, Lima CD, Erdjument-Bromage H, Tempst P, Nathan C. Metabolic enzymes of mycobacteria linked to antioxidant defense by a thioredoxin-like protein. *Science* 2002; 295: 1073-1077.
48. Chauhan R, Mande SC. Site-directed mutagenesis reveals a novel catalytic mechanism of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* alkylhydroperoxidase C. *Biochem J* 2002; 367: 255-261.
49. Hillas PJ, del Alba FS, Oyarzabal J, Wilks A, Ortiz De Montellano PR. The AhpC and AhpD antioxidant defense system of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Biol Chem* 2000; 275: 18801-18809.
50. Heym B, Stavropoulos E, Honoré N, Domenech P, Saint-Joanis B, Wilson TM, Collins DM, Colston MJ, Cole ST. Effects of overexpression of the alkyl hydroperoxide reductase AhpC on the virulence and isoniazid resistance of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Infect Immun* 1997; 65: 1395-1401.
51. Kremer L, Dover LG, Carrère S, Nampoothiri KM, Lesjean S, Brown AK, Brennan PJ, Minnikin DE, Loch C, Besra GS. Mycolic acid biosynthesis and enzymic characterization of the beta-ketoacyl-ACP synthase A-condensing enzyme from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Biochem J* 2002; 364: 423-430.
52. Schaeffer ML, Agnihotri G, Volker C, Kallender H, Brennan PJ, Lonsdale JT. Purification and biochemical characterization of the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* beta-ketoacyl-acyl carrier protein synthases KasA and KasB. *J Biol Chem* 2001; 276: 47029-47037.
53. Slayden RA, Barry CE. The role of KasA and KasB in the biosynthesis of meromycolic acids and isoniazid resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Tuberculosis* 2002; 82: 149-160.
54. Inoyama D, Awasthi D, Capodagli GC, Tsotetsi K, Sukheja P, Zimmerman M, Li SG, Jadhav R, Russo R, Wang X, Grady C, Richmann T, Shrestha R, Li L, Ahn YM, Liang H PH, Mina M, Park S, Perlin DS, Freundlich JS. A Preclinical Candidate Targeting *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* KasA. *Cell Chem Bio* 2020; 27: 560-570.e10.
55. Hu Y, Morichaud Z, Chen S, Leonetti JP, Brodolin K. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* RbpA protein is a new type of transcriptional activator that stabilizes the  $\sigma$  A -containing RNA polymerase holoenzyme. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2012; 40: 6547-6557.
56. White RJ, Lancini GC, Silvestri LG. Mechanism of Action of Rifampin on *Mycobacterium smegmatis*. *J of Bacteriol* 1971; 108: 737-741.
57. Pang Y, Lu J, Wang Y, Song Y, Wang S, Zhao Y. Study of the rifampin monoresistance mechanism in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2013; 57: 893-900.
58. Weiss LA, Harrison PG, Nickels BE, Glickman MS, Campbell EA, Darst SA, Stallings CL. Interaction of CarD with RNA Polymerase Mediates *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Viability, Rifampin Resistance, and Pathogenesis. *J Bacteriol* 2012; 194: 5621-5631.
59. Clarridge JE. Impact of 16S rRNA Gene Sequence Analysis for Identification of Bacteria on Clinical Microbiology and Infectious Diseases. *Clin Microbiol Rev* 2004; 17: 840-862.
60. Finken M, Kirschner P, Meier A, Wrede A, Böttger EC. Molecular basis of streptomycin resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Alterations of the ribosomal protein S12 gene and point mutations within a functional 16S ribosomal RNA pseudoknot. *Mol Microbiol* 2004; 9: 1239-1246.
61. Okamoto S, Tamaru A, Nakajima C, Nishimura K, Tanaka Y, Tokuyama S, Suzuki Y, Ochi K. Loss of a conserved 7-methylguanosine modification in 16S rRNA confers low-level streptomycin resistance in bacteria. *Mol Microbiol* 2007; 63: 1096-1106.
62. Zhang J, Angala SK, Pramanik PK, Li K, Crick DC, Liav A, Jozwiak A, Swiezewska E, Jackson M, Chatterjee D. Reconstitution of Functional Mycobacterial Arabinosyltransferase AftC Proteoliposome and Assessment of Decaprenylphosphorylarabinose Analogues as Arabinofuranosyl Donors. *ACS Chemical Biology* 2011; 6: 819-828.
63. Rinder H, Mieskes KT, Tortoli E, Richter E, Casal M, Vaquero M, Cambau E, Feldmann, K, Löscher T. Detection of *embB* codon 306 mutations in ethambutol resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* directly from sputum samples: A low-cost, rapid approach. *Mol Cell Probes* 2001; 15: 37-42.
64. Sreevatsan S, Stockbauer KE, Pan X, Kreiswirth BN, Moghazeh SL, Jacobs WR, Telenti A, Musser JM. Ethambutol resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Critical role of *embB* mutations. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1997; 41: 1677-1681.
65. Belanger AE, Besra GS, Ford ME, Mikusová K, Belisle JT, Brennan PJ, Inamine JM. The *embAB* genes of *Mycobacterium avium* encode an arabinosyl transferase involved in cell wall arabinan biosynthesis that is the target for the antimycobacterial drug ethambutol. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 1996; 93: 11919-11924.
66. Aubry A, Mark Fisher L, Jarlier V, Cambau E. First functional characterization of a singly expressed bacterial type II topoisomerase: The enzyme from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 2006; 348: 158-165.
67. Aubry A, Veziris N, Cambau E, Truffot-Pernot C, Jarlier V, Fisher LM. Novel Gyrase Mutations in Quinolone-Resistant and -Hypersusceptible Clinical Isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Functional Analysis of Mutant Enzymes. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2006; 50: 104-112.
68. Mérens A, Matrat S, Aubry A, Lascols C, Jarlier V, Soussy CJ, Cavallo JD, Cambau E. The Pentapeptide Repeat Proteins MfpAMt and QnrB4 Exhibit Opposite Effects on DNA Gyrase Catalytic Reactions and on the Ternary Gyrase-DNA-Quinolone Complex. *J Bacteriol* 2009; 191: 1587-1594.
69. Bouige A, Darmon A, Piton J, Roue M, Petrella S, Capton E, Forterre P, Aubry A, Mayer C. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* DNA gyrase possesses two functional GyrA-boxes. *Biochem J* 2013; 455: 285-294.
70. Blondeau JM. Fluoroquinolones: Mechanism of action, classification, and development of resistance. *Surv Ophthalmol* 2004; 49: S73-S78.
71. Aubry A, Veziris N, Cambau E, Truffot-Pernot C, Jarlier V, Fisher LM. Novel Gyrase Mutations in Quinolone-Resistant and -Hypersusceptible Clinical Isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: Functional Analysis of Mutant Enzymes. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2006; 50: 104-112.
72. Bouige A, Darmon A, Piton J, Roue M, Petrella S, Capton E, Forterre P, Aubry A, Mayer C. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* DNA gyrase possesses two functional GyrA-boxes. *Biochem J* 2013; 455: 285-294.



73. Fu G, Wu J, Liu W, Zhu D, Hu Y, Deng J, Zhang XE, Bi L, Wang DC. Crystal structure of DNA gyrase B' domain sheds lights on the mechanism for T-segment navigation. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2009; 37: 5908-5916.
74. Matrat S, Veziris N, Mayer C, Jarlier V, Truffot-Pernot C, Camuset J, Bouvet E, Cambau E, Aubry A. Functional Analysis of DNA Gyrase Mutant Enzymes Carrying Mutations at Position 88 in the A Subunit Found in Clinical Strains of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* Resistant to Fluoroquinolones. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2006; 50: 4170-4173.
75. Takiff HE, Salazar L, Guerrero C, Philipp W, Huang WM, Kreiswirth B, Cole ST, Jacobs WR, Telenti A. Cloning and nucleotide sequence of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis gyrA* and *gyrB* genes and detection of quinolone resistance mutations. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1994; 38: 773-780.
76. Rahman MA, Sobia P, Dwivedi VP, Bhawsar A, Singh DK, Sharma P, Moodley P, Kaer LV, Bishai WR, Das G. *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* TlyA Protein Negatively Regulates T Helper (Th) 1 and Th17 Differentiation and Promotes Tuberculosis Pathogenesis. *J Biol Chem* 2015; 290: 14407-14417.
77. Johansen SK, Maus CE, Plikaytis BB, Douthwaite S. Capreomycin Binds across the Ribosomal Subunit Interface Using tlyA-Encoded 2'-O-Methylations in 16S and 23S rRNAs. *Mol Cell* 2006; 23: 173-182.
78. Rahman A, Srivastava SS, Sneh A, Ahmed N, Krishnasastri MV. Molecular characterization of tlyA gene product, Rv1694 of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: A non-conventional hemolysin and a ribosomal RNA methyl transferase. *BMC Biochem* 2010; 11: 35.
79. Maus CE, Plikaytis BB, Shinnick TM. Mutation of tlyA Confers Capreomycin Resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2005; 49: 571-577.
80. Oudghiri A, Karimi H, Chetoui F, Zakhm F, Bourkadi JE, Elmessaoudi MD, Laglaoui A, Chaoui I, El Mzibri M. Molecular characterization of mutations associated with resistance to second-line tuberculosis drug among multidrug-resistant tuberculosis patients from high prevalence tuberculosis city in Morocco. *BMC Infect Dis* 2018; 18: 98.
81. Zhang H, Deng JY, Bi LJ, Zhou YF, Zhang ZP, Zhang, CG, Zhang Y, Zhang, XE. Characterization of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* nicotinamidase/pyrazinamidase. *FEBS J* 2008; 275: 753-762.
82. World Health Organization (WHO). Global tuberculosis report 2013. Geneva: WHO 2013.
83. Blower SM, Chou T. Modeling the emergence of the "hot zones": tuberculosis and the amplification dynamics of drug resistance. *Nat Med* 2004; 10: 1111-1116.
84. Cohen T, Murray M. Modeling epidemics of multidrug-resistant *M. tuberculosis* of heterogeneous fitness. *Nat Med* 2004; 10: 1117-1121.
85. Barnett M, Busby SR, Mitchison DA. Tubercle bacilli resistant to isoniazid: virulence and response to treatment with isoniazid in guinea-pigs and mice. *Br J Exp Pathol* 1953; 34: 568-581.
86. Burgos M, Deriemer K, Small PM, Hopewell PC, Daley CL. Effect of drug resistance on the generation of secondary cases of tuberculosis. *J Infect Dis* 2003; 118: 1878-1884.
87. Davies AP, Billington OJ, Bannister BA, Weir WR, McHugh TD, Gillespie SH. Comparison of fitness of two isolates of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*, one of which had developed multidrug resistance during the course of treatment. *J Infect* 2000; 41: 184-187.
88. Gagneux S, Long CD, Small PM, Van T, Schoolnik GK, Bohannan BJM. The competitive cost of antibiotic resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Science* 2006; 312: 1944-1946.
89. Li Z, Kelley C, Collins F, Rouse D, Morris S. Expression of katG in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* is associated with its growth and persistence in mice and guinea pigs. *J Infect Dis* 1998; 177: 1030-1035.
90. Middlebrook G, Cohn M. Some observations on the pathogenicity of isoniazid resistant variants of tubercle bacilli author. *Science* 1953; 118: 297-299.
91. van Soolingen D, Borgdorff MW, de Haas PE, Sebek MM, Veen J, Dessens M, Kremer K, van Embden JD. Molecular epidemiology of tuberculosis in the Netherlands: a nationwide study from 1993 through 1997. *J Infect Dis* 1999; 180: 726-736.
92. Billington OJ, McHugh TD, Gillespie SH. Physiological cost of rifampin resistance induced in vitro in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1999; 43: 1866-1869.
93. Wilson TM, Lisle GW, Collins DM. Effect of inhA and katG on isoniazid resistance virulence of *Mycobacterium bovis*. *Mol Microbiol* 1995; 15: 1009-1015.
94. Bergval IL, Schuitema ARJ, Klatser PR, Anthony RM. Resistant mutants of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* selected in vitro do not reflect the in vivo mechanism of isoniazid resistance. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2009; 64: 515-523.
95. Ordway DJ, Sonnenberg MG, Donahue SA, Belisle JT, Orme IM. Drug-resistant strains of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* exhibit a range of virulence for mice. *Infect Immun* 1995; 63: 741-743.
96. Gagneux S, Burgos MV, DeRiemer K, Encisco A, Muñoz S, Hopewell PC, Small PM, Pym AS. Impact of bacterial genetics on the transmission of isoniazid-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *PLoS Pathog* 2006; 2: e61.
97. van Doorn HR, de Haas PEW, Kremer K, Vandenbroucke-Grauls CMJE, Borgdorff MW, van Soolingen D. Public health impact of isoniazid-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains with a mutation at amino-acid position 315 of katG: a decade of experience in The Netherlands. *Clin Microbiol Infect* 2006; 12: 769-775.
98. Lee JH, Ammerman NC, Nolan S, Geiman DE, Lun S, Guo H, Bishai WR. Isoniazid resistance without a loss of fitness in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Nat Commun* 2012; 3: 753.
99. Pym AS, Saint-joanis B, Cole ST. Effect of katG Mutations on the Virulence of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and the Implication for Transmission in Humans. *Infect Immun* 2002; 70: 4955-4960.
100. Comas I, Borrell S, Roetzer A, Rose G, Malla B, Kato-Maeda M, Galagan J, Niemann S, Gagneux S. Whole-genome sequencing of rifampicin-resistant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* strains identifies compensatory mutations in RNA polymerase genes. *Nat Genet* 2011; 44: 106-110.
101. Sherman D, Mdluli K, Hickey M, Barry CI, Stover C. AhpC, oxidative stress and drug resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Biofactors* 1999; 10: 211-217.
102. Day T, Alizon S, Mideo N. Bridging scales in the evolution of infectious disease life histories: theory. *Evolution* 2011; 65: 3448-3461.
103. Mideo N, Alizon S, Day T. Linking within- and between-host dynamics in the evolutionary epidemiology of infectious diseases. *Trends Ecol Evol* 2008; 23: 511-517.
104. Björkman J, Nagaev I, Berg O, Hughes D, Andersson DI. Effects of environment on compensatory mutations to ameliorate costs of antibiotic resistance. *Science* 2000; 287: 1479-1482.
105. Bull J, Levin B. Mice are not furry petri dishes. *Science* 2000; 287: 1409-1410.
106. Finken M, Kirschner P, Meier A, Wrede A, Böttger EC. Molecular basis of streptomycin resistance in *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*: alterations of the ribosomal protein S12 gene and point mutations within a functional 16S ribosomal RNA pseudoknot. *Mol Microbiol* 1993; 9: 1239-1246.
107. Funatsu G, Wittmann HG. Ribosomal proteins. Location of amino-acid replacements in protein S12 isolated from *Escherichia coli* mutants resistant to streptomycin. *J Mol Biol* 1972; 68: 547-550.
108. Tubulekas I, Hughes D. Suppression of rpsL phenotypes by tuf mutations reveals a unique relationship between translation elongation and growth rate. *Mol Microbiol* 1993; 7: 275-284.

109. Björkman J, Hughes D, Andersson DI. Virulence of antibiotic-resistant *Salmonella typhimurium*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 1998; 95: 3949-3953.
110. Sander P, Springer B, Prammananan T, Sturmfels A, Kappler M, Pletschette M, Böttger EC. Fitness cost of chromosomal drug resistance-conferring mutations. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2002; 46: 1204-1211
111. Miskinyte M, Gordo I. Increased survival of antibiotic-resistant *Escherichia coli* inside macrophages. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2013; 57: 189-195.
112. Hobby GL, Meyer K, Chaffee E. Observations on the Mechanism of Action of Penicillin. *Exp Biol Med* 1942; 50: 281-285.
113. Bigger J. Treatment of staphylococcal infections with penicillin by intermittent sterilisation. *Lancet* 1944; 244: 497-500.
114. Hobby GL, Lenert TF. The in vitro action of antituberculous agents against multiplying and non-multiplying microbial cells. *Am Rev Tuberc* 1957; 76: 1031-1048.
115. Koul A, Arnoult E, Lounis N, Guillemont J, Andries K. The challenge of new drug discovery for tuberculosis. *Nature* 2011; 469: 483-490.
116. McCune RM, Feldmann FM, Lambert HP, McDermott W. Microbial persistence. I. The capacity of tubercle bacilli to survive sterilization in mouse tissues. *J Exp Med* 1966; 123: 445-468.
117. Scanga CA, Mohan VP, Joseph H, Yu K, Chan J, Flynn JL. Reactivation of latent tuberculosis: variations on the Cornell murine model. *Infect Immun* 1999; 67: 4531-4538.
118. Pai SR, Actor JK, Sepulveda E, Hunter RL Jr, Jagannath C. Identification of viable and non-viable *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in mouse organs by directed RT-PCR for antigen 85B mRNA. *Microb Pathog* 2000; 28: 335-342.
119. Mukamolova GV, Turapov O, Malkin J, Woltmann G, Barer MR. Resuscitation-promoting factors reveal an occult population of tubercle Bacilli in Sputum. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2010; 181: 174-180.
120. Chengalroyen MD, Beukes GM, Gordhan BG, Streicher EM, Churchyard G, Hafner R, Warren R, Otway K, Martinson N, Kana BD. Detection and Quantification of Differentially Culturable Tubercle Bacteria in Sputum from Patients with Tuberculosis. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2016; 194: 1532-1540.
121. Betts JC, Lukey PT, Robb LC, McAdam RA, Duncan K. Evaluation of a nutrient starvation model of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* persistence by gene and protein expression profiling. *Mol Microbiol* 2002; 43: 717-731.
122. Brooks JV, Furney SK, Orme IM. Metronidazole therapy in mice infected with tuberculosis. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1999; 43: 1285-1288.
123. Carroll MW, Jeon D, Mountz JM, Lee JD, Jeong YJ, Zia N, Lee M, Lee J, Via LE, Lee S, Eum SY, Lee SJ, Goldfeder LC, Cai Y, Jin B, Kim Y, Oh T, Chen RY, Dodd LE, Gu W, Dartois V, Park SK, Kim CT, Barry CE 3rd, Cho SN. Efficacy and safety of metronidazole for pulmonary multidrug-resistant tuberculosis. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2013; 57: 3903-3909.
124. Hoff DR, Caraway ML, Brooks EJ, Driver ER, Ryan GJ, Peloquin CA, Orme IM, Basaraba RJ, Lenaerts AJ. Metronidazole lacks antibacterial activity in guinea pigs infected with *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 2008; 52: 4137-4140.
125. Lin PL, Dartois V, Johnston PJ, Janssen C, Via L, Goodwin MB, Klein E, Barry CE 3rd, Flynn JL. Metronidazole prevents reactivation of latent *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection in macaques. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2012; 109: 14188-14193.
126. Via LE, Lin PL, Ray SM, Carrillo J, Allen SS, Eum SY, Taylor K, Klein E, Manjunatha U, Gonzales J, Lee EG, Park SK, Raleigh JA, Cho SN, McMurray DN, Flynn JL, Barry CE 3rd. Tuberculous granulomas are hypoxic in guinea pigs, rabbits, and nonhuman primates. *Infect Immun* 2008; 76: 2333-2340.
127. Wayne LG. Dormancy of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and latency of disease. *Eur J Clin Microbiol Infect Dis* 1994; 13: 908-914.
128. Wayne LG, Sramek HA. Metronidazole is bactericidal to dormant cells of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother* 1994; 38: 2054-2058.
129. Boshoff HI, Barry CE 3rd. Tuberculosis - metabolism and respiration in the absence of growth. *Nat Rev Microbiol* 2005; 3: 70-80.
130. Cunningham-Bussell A, Zhang T, Nathan CF. Nitrite produced by *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* in human macrophages in physiologic oxygen impacts bacterial ATP consumption and gene expression. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2013; 110: E4256-E4265.
131. Watanabe S, Zimmermann M, Goodwin MB, Sauer U, Barry CE 3rd, Boshoff HI. Fumarate reductase activity maintains an energized membrane in anaerobic *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *PLoS Pathog* 2011; 7: e1002287.
132. Wade MM, Zhang Y. Anaerobic incubation conditions enhance pyrazinamide activity against *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Med Microbiol* 2004; 53: 769-777.
133. Manyi-Loh C, Mamphweli S, Meyer E, Okoh A. Antibiotic Use in Agriculture and Its Consequential Resistance in Environmental Sources: Potential Public Health Implications. *Molecules: A J of Syn Chem and Nat Pro Chem* 2018; 23: 795.
134. Gold B, Nathan C. Targeting Phenotypically Tolerant *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Microbiol Spectr* 2017; 5: 27.